

1 HON. RICHARD A. JONES
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

9 JUSTIN R. VORHEES, and KASSI
10 BLANCHARD, spouses,
11 Plaintiffs,

12 v.
13
14 ESURANCE INSURANCE SERVICES, INC.,
an ALLSTATE INSURANCE SERVICES,
INC. company, foreign corporations doing
business in the State of Washington,

15 Defendants.

CASE NO. 2:23-cv-00420-RAJ

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

17 **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

18 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or
19 private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby
20 stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties
21 acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection
22 on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use
23 extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the
24 applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential
25 information under seal.

26 STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER
2:23-CV-00420-RAJ - 1

Williams, Kastner & Gibbs PLLC
601 Union Street, Suite 4100
Seattle, WA 98101-2380
P: (206) 628-6600 • F: (206) 628-6611

2. "CONFIDENTIAL" MATERIAL

“Confidential” material shall include the following documents and tangible things produced or otherwise exchanged:

- Manuals, guidelines, memoranda, written policies, software programs, and other similar documents or programs relating to or used in Esurance’s investigation, evaluation, adjustment, and/or handling of the insurance claim at issue.

3. SCOPE

8 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as defined
9 above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2) all copies,
10 excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,
11 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

12 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in
13 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

15 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
16 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
17 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to the
18 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential material
19 must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures
20 that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

21 4.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered
22 by the Court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may disclose any
23 confidential material only to:

(b) The officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney's Eyes Only and is so designated;

(c) Experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (**Exhibit A**);

(d) The Court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

20 4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or
21 referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party, in
22 accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will
23 remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion
24 to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the
25 designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue,

1 and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing
 2 the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and
 3 the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material
 4 under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the
 5 requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal.
 6 Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with
 7 the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

8 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

9 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party
 10 or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take care
 11 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The
 12 designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or
 13 oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the material, documents, items,
 14 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the
 15 ambit of this agreement.

16 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
 17 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to
 18 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses
 19 and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

20 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for
 21 protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties
 22 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

23 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
 24 agreement (see, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or
 25 ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must be

1 clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

2 (a) Information in documentary form: (e.g., paper or electronic documents and
 3 deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings),
 4 the designating party must affix the word “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that contains
 5 confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection,
 6 the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
 7 markings in the margins).

8 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties
 9 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial
 10 proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony
 11 after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after receiving the
 12 transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or
 13 exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect confidential information
 14 at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

15 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place on
 16 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word
 17 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,
 18 the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

19 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
 20 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party’s
 21 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
 22 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated
 23 in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

24 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

25 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of

1 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality
2 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
3 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
4 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
5 original designation is disclosed.

6 6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
7 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential
8 designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration
9 or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other
10 affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list
11 the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-
12 to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

13 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
14 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local
15 Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of persuasion
16 in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an
17 improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties)
18 may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain the material
19 in question as confidential until the Court rules on the challenge.

**7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
OTHER LITIGATION**

If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that party must:

(a) Promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the

1 || subpoena or court order;

8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

**9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
PROTECTED MATERIAL**

When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and

1 summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of destruction.

2 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all
3 documents filed with the Court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence,
4 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work
5 product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

6 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a
7 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER
2:23-CV-00420-RAJ - 8

Williams, Kastner & Gibbs PLLC
601 Union Street, Suite 4100
Seattle, WA 98101-2380
P: (206) 628-6600 • F: (206) 628-6611

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2 DATED: March 19, 2024

/s/ Tom Mumford, WSBA #28652
3 Attorney for Plaintiffs

4 DATED: March 19, 2024

/s/ Morgan A. Cooper, WSBA #58500
5 Attorney for Defendants

6

7 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

8 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any
9 documents, electronically stored information (ESI) or information, whether inadvertent or
10 otherwise, in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or
11 state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those
12 documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other
13 privilege or protection recognized by law. This Order shall be interpreted to provide the maximum
14 protection allowed by Fed. R. Evid. 502(d). The provisions of Fed. R. Evid. 502(b) do not apply.
15 Nothing contained herein is intended to or shall serve to limit a party's right to conduct a review of
16 documents, ESI or information (including metadata) for relevance, responsiveness and/or
17 segregation of privileged and/or protected information before production. Information produced in
18 discovery that is protected as privileged or work product shall be immediately returned to the
19 producing party.

20

21 DATED this 20th day of March, 2024.



22
23 The Honorable Richard A. Jones
24 United States District Judge
25
26

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, Tom Mumford, of 1601 F. Street, Bellingham, Washington 98225, declare under penalty
4 of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
5 issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on March 20,
6 2024, in the case of *Justin Vorhees and Kassi Blanchard v. Esurance Insurance Co., et. al*, Cause
7 No. 2:23-cv-00420-RAJ. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated
8 Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to
9 sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in
10 any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person
11 or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

15 || Date:

16 | City and State where sworn and signed:

17 Printed name:

18 || Signature:

19

20 ||

21 ||

22 || Page

22 || Page

24 || Page

25 || Page

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

Williams, Kastner & Gibbs PLLC
601 Union Street, Suite 4100
Seattle, WA 98101-2380
P: (206) 628-6600 • F: (206) 628-6611